# Online Education Initiative
# Course Design Rubric Scoresheet

| Course Identifier: | CID | College |
|---|---|---|
| | CDEV 100 | Antelope Valley College |
| **Faculty Name:** | C. Overdorf | |
| **Reviewer Name:** | Review Team B | |

**Course Design**

| Section A | Score |
|---|---|
| A.1 | 2 |
| A.2 | 1 |
| A.3 | 2 |

**Interaction & Collaboration**

| Section B | Score |
|---|---|
| B.1 | 3 |
| B.2 | 2 |
| B.3 | 3 |

**Assessment**

| Section C | Score |
|---|---|
| C.1 | 4 |
| C.2 | 4 |

**Learner Support**

| Section D | Score |
|---|---|
| D.1 | 1 |
| D.2 | 2 |
| D.3 | |
| D.4 | |

| *Section A Total* | 5 |
|---|---|

| *Section B Total* | 8 |
|---|---|

| *Section C Total* | 8 |
|---|---|

| *Section D Total* | 3 |
|---|---|

| **Cumulative Score =** | 24 |
|---|---|

| The course has a minimum score of 3 **(Satisfactory)** in each sub-category | No |
|---|---|

CALIFORNIA COMMUNITY COLLEGES
ONLINE EDUCATION
INITIATIVE

# Course Design Rubric Peer Response

| | |
|---|---|
| **Course C-ID:** | CDEV100 |
| **College Course ID/Name:** | CFE102 |
| **Faculty Name:** | Catherine Overdorf |
| **College Name:** | Antelope Valley College |
| **Date Reviewed:** | 5/27/15 |

Thank you for submitting your course for review, and for participating in the OEI pilot! This response is divided into two sections: a narrative response from your review team, and a score sheet. Here is some important information to help you work with your review response.

## Narrative Response
A team of three California Community College faculty reviewed your course. Your review contains narrative responses from your review team for each section of the rubric. These responses are designed to help you strengthen and improve your online course, regardless of your score, so even exemplary courses will have suggestions for improvement. This feedback is formative—it's designed to help you think about ways to improve your course. The feedback includes suggestions, not mandates.

## Review Scores
Your review has been scored in every section except D3 and D4. These sections will be reviewed by a separate team of accessibility experts. A passing score is 70%, with a minimum score of 3 in each section. Regardless of your score, we hope you will use the review process to further strengthen your online course.

## Accessibility

While you are waiting for your accessibility review, you may want to review some of the common accessibility issues.  In the first round of reviews, we noted the following trends:

- Images did not include Alt Text, or Alt Text was not adequately descriptive;
- Videos were not captioned, or the captioning contained errors;
- PDF and WORD documents were not accessible.

To help you solve these persistent issues, we'd like to point you to the following resources:

WebAim article on Alt Text/Accessible Images http://webaim.org/techniques/alttext/
Creating Accessible PDF documents with Microsoft Word and Acrobat Pro
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=DrqIm31TE40
Online Course Useability
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=jTogzQ9bsTY

# Section A: Course Design

*Course Design addresses elements of instructional design. For the purpose of this program, course design includes such elements as structure of the course, learning objectives, organization of content, and instructional strategies.*

## A.1    Objectives

To be distinguished in section A1 the course must exhibit the following:
- Objectives are made available in a variety of areas in the course (within the syllabus and each individual learning unit or module)
- Objectives are clearly written at the appropriate level and reflect desired outcomes
- Objectives are written in measurable outcomes (students know what they are expected to be able to do)

| Distinguished (5)to Exemplary (6) | Satisfactory (3) to Accomplished (4) | Promising (2) | Incomplete (1) |
|---|---|---|---|
|  |  | 2 |  |

| Reviewer Response: |
|---|
| The overall course objectives are clear and comprehensive, and are included in the syllabus. The Student Learning Outcomes appear later in the syllabus and are clearly measurable.  The course links the syllabus inside the course shell.<br><br>Course Design Section A1 describes an exemplary course as one that includes objectives "within the syllabus and each individual learning unit or module."<br><br>To move this course into the next level, consider creating learning modules for each unit, and then adding learning objectives right at the top of each module. The objectives can be taken from your syllabus and applied to each module, or they could be modified into terms that are more understandable to students. Objectives at each module tell students where they're going and what they'll learn through the module's various activities. That way, students see what they need as they need it while working in the course. |

# Section A: Course Design

*Course Design addresses elements of instructional design. For the purpose of this program, course design includes such elements as structure of the course, learning objectives, organization of content, and instructional strategies.*

## A.2    Content Presentation
To be distinguished in section A2 the course must exhibit the following:
- Content is made available or "chunked" in manageable segments (i.e., presented in distinct learning units or modules)
- Navigation is intuitive and content flows in a logical progression
- Content is presented using a variety of appropriate mechanisms (content modules, single pages, links to external resources, and/or multimedia, etc.)
- CMS tools are used to reduce the labor-intensity of learning (e.g., providing links to needed resources where they will be used in the course, integrating publisher resources that are tailored to the course materials, and providing streamlined access to supplementary materials)
- Clearly labeled tutorial materials that explain how to navigate the CMS **and** the specific course are included

| Distinguished (5)to Exemplary (6) | Satisfactory (3) to Accomplished (4) | Promising (2) | Incomplete (1) |
|---|---|---|---|
| | | | 1 |

| Reviewer Response: |
|---|
| The content seems to flow in a logical progression as described in the announcements that provide clear information on what is expected of students that week. Each content area, including discussions, assignments, lecture guides, etc. has its own tab on the side navigation bar. They are clearly labeled and easy to understand.<br><br>But while the navigation is clear on the menu, there are no learning modules where course material and activities are chunked together to provide an intuitive and logical progression within each unit, and ultimately within the course.<br><br>Section A2 states that exemplary courses use distinct learning modules or units and that CMS tools are used to reduce the "labor intensity" that occurs when students have to navigate through multiple tabs to complete work for each unit. Instead, consider setting up a table of contents with learning modules. Inside each learning module, include the learning objectives, and then link all of the assignments, quizzes, discussions, lecture guides, etc. that are due in that unit or that specified time period. (It appears that this class uses weeks as a unit. So the materials due for the week could be clustered inside that week's module.)<br><br>Section A2 also recommends including clearly labeled tutorial materials specific to the course. In this course, the tutorial or resource links in the "Web Links" content area would be enhanced with a label that describes the resource. |

# Section A: Course Design

*Course Design addresses elements of instructional design. For the purpose of this program, course design includes such elements as structure of the course, learning objectives, organization of content, and instructional strategies.*

## A.3    Learner Engagement

To be distinguished in section A3 the course must exhibit the following:
- It is clear how the instructional strategies will enable students to reach course objectives
- Course design includes guidance for learners to work with content in meaningful ways
- Individualized learning opportunities, remedial activities, or resources for advanced learning activities are provided
- Tools available within the course management system (CMS) are used to facilitate learning by engaging students with course content
- Technologies are used creatively in ways that transcend traditional, teacher-centered instruction
- Learners have the opportunity to give anonymous feedback to the instructor regarding course design and course content both during course delivery and after course completion

| Distinguished (5)to Exemplary (6) | Satisfactory (3) to Accomplished (4) | Promising (2) | Incomplete (1) |
|---|---|---|---|
|  |  | 2 |  |

| Reviewer Response: |
|---|
| The course design requires student engagement with the material through weekly assignments, reading, discussion, and lecture. The materials provided for student research and discussion seem to encourage engagement and interaction. In one of the weekly discussion forums, for instance, students are required to role-play as genetics counselors, a technique that would be very engaging to students and would lead them toward achieving course outcomes. The syllabus includes clear guidance on requirements for discussion forums, while instructions for submitting assignments are available in the Resources area. |

Section A3 suggests that "technologies are used creatively in ways that transcend traditional, teacher-centered instruction." The course lecture guides, for instance, which appear to come directly from the publisher in the form of simple text in outline, could be enhanced with instructor input to include a diversity of technology-based content. One video on Piaget's Theory is included, but it is in the Resource section where students may not think to look.

While the level of discussion forums and assignments may engage advanced students, the course does not appear to have any materials for 'remedial' learners that Section A3 suggests, beyond the text-centric lecture guides and flashcards, if they are to be considered remedial. An example of an assignment paper is included in the 'Resources' section, but it's unclear how students would know to look there. However, the Discussion Forums provide the "Assignment Helper" and the "Technology Forum," for open feedback.

# Section A: Course Design

*Course Design addresses elements of instructional design. For the purpose of this program, course design includes such elements as structure of the course, learning objectives, organization of content, and instructional strategies.*

To move this course to the Distinguished or Exemplary level, consider organizing (and more clearly labeling) the Resources and other tabs where resource material is included, as well as adding these resources to each module as needed to enable learner engagement. The course includes some diverse resources to help students that would be much more useful if presented in a logical sequence.

Section A3 also suggests including an anonymous survey during the course, which can provide useful feedback for instructors on design.

# Section B: Interaction and Collaboration

*Interaction and Collaboration can take many forms. These criteria place emphasis on the type and amount of interaction and collaboration within an online environment.*

## B.1 Communication Strategies

To be distinguished in section B1 the course must exhibit the following:

- Contact information for the instructor is easy to find and includes multiple forms of communication (for example, e-mail, phone, chat, etc.)
- Expected response time for email replies (or other communication tool) is included
- The instructor's role within the course is explained (for example, instructor participation in discussions and activities, role—if any—in tech support, etc.)
- The instructor's methods of collecting and returning work are clearly explained
- There are plentiful opportunities for interaction, as appropriate
- Communication strategies promote critical thinking or other higher order thinking aligned with learning objectives
- Communication activities benefit from timely interactions and facilitate "rapid response" communication (i.e., students gain practice discussing course content extemporaneously without looking up basic, declarative information)

| Distinguished (5)to Exemplary (6) | Satisfactory (3) to Accomplished (4) | Promising (2) | Incomplete (1) |
|---|---|---|---|
|  | 3 |  |  |

| Reviewer Response: |
|---|
| The instructor provides email and telephone contact information in the menu/navigation bar, in the syllabus and again in an announcement. The syllabus also describes the instructor's online office hours and how to 'chat' with the instructor. The 'chat' during office hours could facilitate 'rapid response' as Section B1 describes, but it could also indicate synchronous communication as well.

The discussion forums where students interact promote critical thinking with engaging instructor prompts. Although the instructor states that she does not participate in discussion forums to avoid dampening student discussion, the course provides other opportunities for communication, as above. However, it is unclear whether students benefit here from timely interactions as Section B1 suggests, as reviewers could not see the actual discussions.

The comprehensive syllabus also provides excellent instructions on how work is collected and returned as well as when assignments are due, how much time students should allocate to the class, and the methods of evaluation and grading.

Section B1 also suggests that the instructor advise students of the instructor's role in the class as well as expected turn-around time for grades and responses. |

# Section B: Interaction and Collaboration

*Interaction and Collaboration can take many forms. These criteria place emphasis on the type and amount of interaction and collaboration within an online environment.*

## B.2 Development of Learning Community

To be distinguished in section B2 the course must exhibit the following:

- Instructors have a plan for initiating contact prior to or at the beginning of class and at regular intervals during the course
- Communication activities are designed to help build a sense of community among learners
- Student-to-student interactions are required as part of the course. Students are encouraged to initiate communication with the instructor
- Collaboration activities (if included) reinforce course content and learning outcomes, while building workplace-useful skills such as teamwork, cooperation, negotiation, and consensus-building

| Distinguished (5)to Exemplary (6) | Satisfactory (3) to Accomplished (4) | Promising (2) | Incomplete (1) |
|---|---|---|---|
| | | 2 | |

| Reviewer Response: |
|---|
| The instructor's application mentions emailing students two weeks prior to the class, while announcements show continued communication throughout the course. Additionally, the instructor requires that students return the email to ensure they have received the notification, a strategy that encourages student contact with the instructor. The initial 'meet and greet' discussion, the weekly discussion forums with detailed prompts, and the collaborative chat room sessions provide required, graded opportunities for students to interact and exchange ideas. The Technology and Assignment Helper Forums allow students to help each other, which can create a sense of community. <br><br> Section B3 suggests that students should be encouraged to initiate contact with the instructor. Perhaps a light touch by the instructor in the discussion forums might encourage students to engage with the instructor as well as with each other. <br> To move to the Distinguished or Exemplary levels, Section B3 also suggests that collaborative activities build teamwork and create consensus-building. The instructor mentions in the application a community of learners has been difficult to establish (making any group work difficult) because some students are more lifelong learners who are more interested in broad concepts than on completing all activities. Other students may post right before discussions close. These students and all students might be additionally engaged with more collaborative activities such as assignments in which students work together in groups toward a shared goal, as the rubric suggests. To move the course to exemplary on B3 and move toward creating a community of learners, consider assigning groups that work together to reinforce and share ideas. (Be sure to watch and remove non-participants from groups, as they can disrupt the group work.) This can help foster a more active sense of community. |

# Section B: Interaction and Collaboration

*Interaction and Collaboration can take many forms. These criteria place emphasis on the type and amount of interaction and collaboration within an online environment.*

## B.3 Interaction Logistics

To be distinguished in section B3 the course must exhibit the following:

- Guidelines explaining required levels of participation (i.e., quantity of interactions) are provided
- Expectations regarding the quality of communications (e.g., what constitutes a "good" answer) are clearly defined
- A rubric or equivalent grading document is included to explain how participation will be evaluated
- The instructor plans to participate actively in communication activities, including providing feedback to students
- The instructor plans to use communication tools effectively to provide course updates, reminders, special announcements, etc.

| Distinguished (5)to Exemplary (6) | Satisfactory (3) to Accomplished (4) | Promising (2) | Incomplete (1) |
|---|---|---|---|
|  | 3 |  |  |

| Reviewer Response: |
|---|
| Couse announcements explaining how to get started and what is due help guide students so that they understand what is expected of them each week.<br><br>The course syllabus provides guidance on required levels of participation in discussion forums, and is explicit in stating that students must post to the discussions each week to remain in the class.<br><br>However, while the course provides extensive detailed rubrics for written assignments that must be very helpful for students as they work on their observations and other papers, there are no such guidelines for discussions or interactions. The syllabus states that "In order to receive the maximum number of points students must post a substantial discussion, approximately 2 paragraphs in length." That's a good start, but there was no definition of what the instructor considered 'substantial.' Similarly, guidance for replies suggests that a response of "I agree" is not adequate, but there was no guidance for what is acceptable.<br><br>To bring this section up to an exemplary level, consider adding more substantive instructions or rubrics for discussions to the syllabus and to the discussions themselves. Samples of what is considered acceptable and substantive would also be helpful. |

# Section C: Assessment

*Assessment focuses on instructional activities designed to measure progress towards learning outcomes, provide feedback to students and instructor, and/or enable grade assignment. This section addresses the quality and type of student assessments within the course.*

## C.1    Expectations

To be distinguished in section C1 the course must exhibit the following:
- Assessments match the objectives
- Learners are directed to the appropriate objective(s) for each assessment
- Rubrics and/or descriptive criteria for desired outcomes are provided (models of "good work" may be shown, for example)
- Instructions are written clearly and with exemplary detail to ensure understanding

| Distinguished (5)to Exemplary (6) | Satisfactory (3) to Accomplished (4) | Promising (2) | Incomplete (1) |
|---|---|---|---|
|  | 4 |  |  |

| Reviewer Response: |
|---|
| The assessments appear to match the objectives, and learners are directed to the appropriate assessments. Instructions on the assignments are very clear, with detailed rubrics provided, and some include objectives as well.  One sample of a 'good' assignment is included in the Resource section.<br><br>Students can choose to complete a pre-quiz to test their readiness if they like before the graded quiz. The course includes multiple quizzes for each chapter. Multiple attempts are allowed on the final and midterm, allowing students to use even these large exams as formative assessments, self-correcting until they find correct answers.<br><br>However, some of the rubrics may be misplaced. One assignment rubric showed what appeared to be a discussion forum requirement. [This will explain how I grade the discussion forum.  Participating at least 2 times during the week is measured by posting on 2 different days; you may actually make 3 postings but participation only occurred 1 time during the week.]<br><br>To move to exemplary, consider checking each of the rubrics and assignments, and perhaps including examples of additional student work with the assignment itself. |

# Section C: Assessment

*Assessment focuses on instructional activities designed to measure progress towards learning outcomes, provide feedback to students and instructor, and/or enable grade assignment. This section addresses the quality and type of student assessments within the course.*

## C.2    Assessment Design

To be distinguished in section C2 the course must exhibit the following:
- Assessment activities have "face validity" (i.e., they appear to match the curriculum and are explained using appropriate reading level and vocabulary)
- Higher order thinking is required (e.g., analysis, problem-solving, etc.)
- Assessments are designed to mimic authentic environments to facilitate transfer
- Assessment activities occur frequently throughout the duration of the course, and the instructor provides meaningful feedback in a timely manner
- Multiple types of assessments are used (research project, objective test, discussions, etc.)
- Opportunities for student self-assessment are plentiful, and provide feedback that allows students to seek additional help when necessary.

| Distinguished (5)to Exemplary (6) | Satisfactory (3) to Accomplished (4) | Promising (2) | Incomplete (1) |
|---|---|---|---|
|  | 4 |  |  |

| Reviewer Response: |
|---|
| This course provides many opportunities for student self-assessment as well as for instructor-graded assessment, with a diversity of methods that include quizzes, discussions and assignments. For self-assessment, the instructor offers flashcards, outlines and pre-chapter quizzes. The instructor states in her application that she provides meaningful feedback and grades weekly, which would be timely feedback. <br><br> Higher-order thinking requirements are evident in the thoughtful discussion prompts and assignments. The observation assignments require students to go into the authentic environment, mimicking a real-world assessment.  The assessments occur frequently, with weekly quizzes and discussions and four papers during the course. <br><br> The course has the assessments in place, but needs to now organize them into a more meaningful fashion to move into the Distinguished or Exemplary category.  The quizzes can be difficult to locate, requiring students to go to Documents/Quiz section and then to Student Resources/Quizzes. Although the syllabus tells students that Quiz 1 is the ungraded pre-quiz, that's not clear inside the quiz folder. Additionally, if the instructor were to include a brief explanation of how the practice quiz or flashcards might help students with the graded quiz, that may encourage more students to use this excellent resource. <br> For example, for Chapter 3 Flashcards, might include this explanation: <br> • By working with the flashcards you will be able to practice the new vocabulary words. |

# Section D: Learner Support

*Learner Support addresses the support resources made available to students taking the course. Such resources may be accessible within or external to the course environment. Specifically, learner support resources address a variety of student services.*

## D.1   Supplemental Software

*(if required - it is permissible to award this criterion a 6 if the course does not require software beyond the CMS and browser)*

To be distinguished in section D1 the course must exhibit the following:

- Clear explanations of optional and/or required software including any additional costs are provided within the course
- Software required to use course materials is listed with links to where it can be captured and installed
- Links are located within the course where learners will use the software (i.e., near the materials requiring its use)

| Distinguished (5)to Exemplary (6) | Satisfactory (3) to Accomplished (4) | Promising (2) | Incomplete (1) |
|---|---|---|---|
| | | | 1 |

| Reviewer Response: |
|---|
| This category showed some discrepancies that can easily be resolved. |
| The application states that there are no additional software requirements, but the flashcards require Flash, while the videos may require a download or program such as Windows Media Player. |
| Below is a sample statement to include both in the syllabus and in a labeled menu item that could address this issue and provide links to the downloads: |
| **\*Required Software Downloads** - To be able to play multimedia in the class or on the Internet you *may* need to download Flash, Java Runtime Environment, Adobe Reader and Windows Media Player or equivalent if your computer does not already have the appropriate program. |
| Additionally, the instructor states that assignments must be turned in in Microsoft Word or rich-text formatting.  Perhaps adding instructions on how to access/purchase the Microsoft Suite could be helpful. For instance, a link to https://shop.collegebuys.org/fccc-student-c231.aspx through the Chancellor's Office Foundation (at a cost of less than $40) could be helpful. Or the instructor could provide instructions on how to convert documents to rich-text documents. |

# Section D: Learner Support

*Learner Support addresses the support resources made available to students taking the course. Such resources may be accessible within or external to the course environment. Specifically, learner support resources address a variety of student services.*

## D.2    Course/ Institutional Policies & Support

To be distinguished in section D2 the course must exhibit the following:
- Software used for the course is adequately supported by the institution, including information for students on where they can obtain help
- All activities that might create educational records (as defined by the Family Educational Records Privacy Act) or that involve regular effective contact are conducted within district- or college-supported systems
- Institutional policies, materials, and forms relevant for learner success (for example, plagiarism policies) are clearly labeled and easy to find; links (if present) allow easy navigation from the course to the information and back.
- Course/instructor policies regarding decorum, behavior, and netiquette are easy to find and written clearly to avoid confusion
- Links to institutional services such as the library, or writing center, are clearly labeled and easy to find

| Distinguished (5)to Exemplary (6) | Satisfactory (3) to Accomplished (4) | Promising (2) | Incomplete (1) |
|---|---|---|---|
| | | 2 | |

| Reviewer Response: |
|---|
| The 'Tools' tab provides information on Blackboard and other software and includes a Blackboard Help section as well. All activities that might have confidentiality requirements including grading and protected resources appear to be appropriately contained within the course shell. Even contact is encouraged through the course messaging system. <br><br>The course syllabus provides an excellent explanation of plagiarism policies and the results of violating those policies. Additionally, it mentions policies on netiquette, though it does not define the term, and directs students who need reasonable accommodations to the appropriate resource, though it does not provide a link. <br><br> The syllabus does not include information on the library , counseling, tutoring, or other additional or institutional resources. These resources do not appear to be found anywhere in the course shell, including under the Resources tab. <br><br>To bring this section up to Distinguished or Exemplary, consider posting this important student information in several places. In addition to including links and information in the syllabus, they could be included with modules called "Getting Started," or "Orientation," or could be included in the Resources tab. |

***Sections D.3 & D.4 will not be reviewed by the POCRs; it will instead be reviewed by accessibility specialists as part of the initial review process.***